

(Law Com No 383)

Planning Law in Wales

Cyfraith Cynllunio yng Nghymru

Final Report

Adroddiad Terfynol

Presented to Parliament pursuant to section 3(2) of the Law Commissions Act 1965; and presented to the National Assembly for Wales

Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed on 30 November 2018

November 2018

Tachwedd 2018



© Crown copyright 2018

This publication is licensed under the terms of the Open Government Licence v3.0 except where otherwise stated. To view this licence, visit nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/version/3

Where we have identified any third party copyright information you will need to obtain permission from the copyright holders concerned.

This publication is available at www.gov.uk/government/publications.

Print ISBN 978-1-5286-0905-0

CCS 1118073096 11/18

Printed on paper containing 75% recycled fibre content minimum

Printed in the UK by the APS Group on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office

THE LAW COMMISSION

The Law Commission was set up by the Law Commissions Act 1965 for the purpose of promoting the reform of the law.

The Law Commissioners are:

The Right Honourable Lord Justice Green, Chairman

Professor Nick Hopkins

Stephen Lewis

Professor David Ormerod, QC (Hon)

Nicholas Paines, QC

The Chief Executive of the Law Commission is Phil Golding.

The Law Commission is located at 1st Floor Tower, 52 Queen Anne's Gate, London SW1H 9AG.

The terms of this report were agreed on 6 September 2018.

The text of this report, and of each chapter in it, is available on the Law Commission's website at www.lawcommission.gov.uk/planning-law-in-Wales

To request a paper copy of the Final Report, or if you have any other queries, please send an email to: Planning_wales@lawcommission.gov.uk.



Outline contents

		Page
	Glossary	xvii
	Other abbreviations	xxi
1.	SUMMARY	3
	PART ONE. GENERAL PRINCIPLES	
2.	Towards a new planning code for Wales	27
3.	The consultation exercise	35
4.	General responses to the Consultation Paper	39
	PART TWO. SPECIFIC TOPICS	
5.	Introductory provisions	55
6.	The formulation of the development plan	93
7.	The need for a planning application	101
8.	Applications to the planning authority	119
9.	Applications to the Welsh Ministers	171
10.	The provision of infrastructure and other improvements	179
11.	Appeals and other supplementary provisions	197
12.	Unauthorised development	209
13.	Works affecting listed buildings and conservation areas	247
14.	Outdoor advertising	297
15.	Protected trees and woodlands	321
16.	Improvement, regeneration and renewal	347
17.	High Court challenges	375
18.	Miscellaneous and supplementary provisions	379
	APPENDICES	
A.	Responses to Consultation Paper	407
B.	Recommendations	415

Table of Contents

GLOSSARY	XVII
OTHER ABBREVIATIONS	XXI
CHAPTER 1: SUMMARY	3
Introduction	3
Terminology	3
Acknowledgements	4
Part One: General principles	4
Chapter Two: Towards a new planning code for Wales	4 4
Background The involvement of the Law Commission	4
Chapter Three: The consultation exercise	5
Those we met	5
The response we received	5
Chapter Four: General responses to the consultation paper	5
Part Two: Specific topics	6
Chapter Five: Introductory provisions	6
Principles underlying the Planning Code Administration of the planning system	6 7
Chapter Six: Formulation of the development plan	8
The development plan	8
Planning blight	8
Chapter Seven: The need for a planning application	8
Definition of "development" Redundant methods of granting planning permission	8 9
Certificates of lawfulness	9
Chapter Eight: Applications to the planning authority	10
Seeking planning permission	10
Determining planning applications Conditions attached to planning permission	10 11
Approval of details required by conditions	11
Variation of planning permission	11
Other points	12
Chapter Nine: Applications to the Welsh Ministers	12
Chapter Ten: The provision of infrastructure and other improvements	12
Community infrastructure levy (CIL) Planning obligations	12 13

Chapter Eleven: Appeals and other supplementary provisions	13
Appeals	13
Other supplementary provisions	14
Chapter Twelve: Unauthorised development	14
Preliminary procedure	14
Enforcement notices	14
Stop notices	15
Criminal penalties	15
Chapter Thirteen: Works affecting listed buildings and conservation	4=
areas Overlapping consents	15 15
Overlapping consents Detailed points	16
Unauthorised works	16
Other points	16
Chapter Fourteen: Outdoor advertising	17
Definitions	17
Deemed consent	17
Unauthorised advertisements	18
Chapter Fifteen: Protected trees and woodlands	18
Making of tree preservation orders	18
Need for consent	18
Tree replacement Unauthorised works	19 19
Trees in conservation areas	19
	20
Chapter Sixteen: Improvement, regeneration and renewal Unsightly land and buildings	20
Graffiti and fly-posting	20
Area-based initiatives	20
Acquisition of land for planning purposes	21
Chapter Seventeen: High Court challenges	21
Chapter Eighteen: Miscellaneous and supplementary provisions	21
Statutory undertakers	22
Minerals	22
Fees	22
Inquiries, hearings and other proceedings Definitions	22 22
Definitions	22
PART ONE: GENERAL PRINCIPLES	25
CHAPTER 2: TOWARDS A NEW PLANNING CODE FOR WALES	27
Introduction	27
Planning law in Wales	27
Background: pre-2006	27
Planning law since 2006	28

The involvement of the Law Commission	28
Our recommendations on the form and accessibility of the law	
applicable in Wales	29
The Scoping Paper	30
The Consultation Paper	30
The scope of the codification exercise	30
Technical reforms to the legislation	32
Responses to the Consultation Paper	33
CHAPTER 3: THE CONSULTATION EXERCISE	35
Introduction	35
The distribution of the Consultation Paper	35
Meetings with stakeholders	35
Meetings solely to discuss Consultation Paper	35
Presentation at meetings organised by others	35
Meetings with other stakeholders	36
Those who responded	36
Summary	36
The nature of the responses we received	37
CHAPTER 4: GENERAL RESPONSES TO THE CONSULTATION PAPER	39
Introduction	39
Value of codification	39
Public authorities	39
Professional bodies	40
Private sector bodies	40
Third sector organisations	42
Individual respondents	42
Conclusion: codification in principle	43
Scope of the codification exercise	43
Countryside and rights of way: possible inclusion in the present	
codification	44
Countryside and rights of way: detailed points	46
Minerals	46
Hazardous substances	47
Practicalities of the Planning Code	47
Practicalities of the Planning Code The nature of a Code	47 47
Practicalities of the Planning Code The nature of a Code Contents and presentation of the Code	47 47 48
Practicalities of the Planning Code The nature of a Code	47 47

Other general comments	51
The planning system as a barrier to smaller developers Changes to environmental legislation and Aarhus Convention	51
obligations Requirement for a planning authority to take positive action when	51
dealing with planning applications	51
Focus on development management	52
Legislative competence	52
PART TWO: SPECIFIC TOPICS	53
CHAPTER 5: INTRODUCTORY PROVISIONS	55
Introduction	55
Principles underlying the Planning Code	55
Statutory duties applicable to the exercise of planning functions	55
Statutory duties: the Planning Acts	56
Statutory duties: other related legislation	58
Duties at common law: other relevant considerations	60
The duty to have regard to the development plan	60
Proposed enlargement of the duty	60
The bodies to whom the duty should apply The functions to which the duty should apply	61 62
Conclusion	64
The general duty to have regard to other material considerations	64
Possible reforms	64
Inclusion in the Bill of a definition of "material considerations"	65
"Material considerations" or "relevant considerations"?	66
Functions to which the duty should be applied	68
Specific material considerations (1): listed buildings and other	60
historic assets The existing law	69 69
General duty to have regard (or special regard) to historic assets	70
Categories of historic assets to which the duty should apply	71
Duty to have consider historic assets: other points	72
Specific material considerations (2): the use of the Welsh language	74
Specific material considerations (3): Welsh Government policy	78
The sustainable development principle	80
The existing law	80
Proposed change	80
Response	81

Duties under other statutory schemes	83
Coal mining	84
A statutory purpose for planning control	86
The administration of the planning system The Planning Inspectorate Local planning authorities other than local authorities and national	87 87
park authorities Planning authorities: terminology	89 90
CHAPTER 6: FORMULATION OF THE DEVELOPMENT PLAN	93
Introduction	93
Inclusion in the Code	93
Development plans: other provisions Strategic environmental assessment Inquiries Planning blight	95 96 98 98
CHAPTER 7: THE NEED FOR A PLANNING APPLICATION	101
Introduction	101
Building operations Demolition Building operations other than demolition	101 102 103
Engineering operations	104
Changes of use General principles Use classes regulations Change of use involving a change in the number of dwellings Other changes of use that are not material	106 106 106 107 109
Ways in which planning permission may be granted	109
Permission granted by development order	111
Other forms of planning permission Enterprise zones Simplified planning zones	112 112 113
Applications for certificates of lawfulness Planning application deemed to include an application for a certificate of lawfulness	114 115

CHAPTER 8: APPLICATIONS TO THE PLANNING AUTHORITY	119
Introduction	119
Applying for planning permission Possible simplification Responses in favour Responses disagreeing Consideration	120 120 121 122 123
Application procedure Material to be submitted with applications Ownership certificates Notification of applications to agricultural tenants and mineral owners	124 124 127 128
Determining planning applications The power to decline to determine applications Twin-tracking Consultation and publicity	129 129 130 131
Conditions on the grant of planning permission Distinction between conditions and limitations General requirements as to conditions Disclosure of draft conditions Specific types of conditions Grampian conditions Pre-commencement conditions: the Whitley principle Conditions as to the period within which development may be started Specific conditions: land under the control of the applicant Specific conditions: time-limited permissions Specific conditions: time-limited permissions Other conditions that may be enforced against those other than the applicant	136 137 138 140 141 142 145 147 148 149
Approval of details Notification of development approved in principle by a development order	151 153
Variation of planning permission The existing law Possible reform Recommendations Variation in case of urgency	155 155 156 157 160
Planning applications: miscellaneous points Procedural details to be moved from primary to secondary legislation Redundant provisions	163 163 164
Other points raised by consultees Split decisions Reasons for decisions Power to dispose of applications Completion notices	165 165 166 167 168

CHAPTER 9: APPLICATIONS TO THE WELSH MINISTERS	171
Introduction	171
Applications in the areas of underperforming planning authorities	171
Developments of national significance Assessors Restatement in the Code	173 175 176
Planning inquiry commissions	177
CHAPTER 10: THE PROVISION OF INFRASTRUCTURE AND OTHER IMPROVEMENTS	179
Introduction	179
Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL)	179
Planning obligations Highways requirements Enforcement of planning obligations Expedition of negotiations as to planning obligations Resolution of disputes as to planning obligations Restriction on the use of planning obligations Planning obligations binding authorities in relation to their own land Planning obligations binding those other than owners of land	181 184 186 189 190 191 193 194
CHAPTER 11: APPEALS AND OTHER SUPPLEMENTARY PROVISIONS	197
Introduction	197
Appeals in connection with planning applications Determination of appeals by inspectors Assessors	197 199 200
Other types of appeal	202
Modification and Revocation of permission; and Discontinuance notices	203
Purchase notices Serving a purchase notice	204 204
Highways affected by development Orders under section 249 of the TCPA 1990 Other provisions in the TCPA 1990 relating to highways	206 207 208

CHAPTER 12: UNAUTHORISED DEVELOPMENT	209
Introduction	209
Preliminary procedure	210
Entering property for enforcement purposes	212
Concealed breaches of planning control	213
enforcement warning notices	215
Temporary stop notices	217
Breach of condition notices	221
Enforcement notices Content of enforcement notice and accompanying note Appeal against an enforcement notice High Court challenge to an enforcement notice	223 223 227 231
Stop notices Service of a notice Stop notices: other proposals	232 232 235
Consequences of enforcement action We recommend that:	237 240
Criminal penalties	243
Historic breaches of planning control	246
Other points	246
CHAPTER 13: WORKS AFFECTING LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS	247
Introduction The existing position Possible reform Statistics Table 13.1 Applications for permission and consent 2015 to 2017	247 247 248 249 249
Unifying planning permission and listed building consent Existing law Proposed reform	250 250 252
Responses in favour of the proposal	253
Responses disagreeing with the proposal There is no problem to be solved Difference in concept between LBC and planning permission Loss of protection for the heritage Other points of principle Loss of relevant expertise Need for consent / permission Processing of applications	254 255 255 256 258 258 260 261

Fees Ecclesiastical exemption from listed building control Other points	262 262 263
Consideration: points of principle The principle of unifying consent regimes Difference in concept between LBC and planning permission Loss of protection for the heritage Loss of specialist expertise Points of principle: conclusion	264 265 266 267 268 268
Consideration: points of detail Need for consent / permission Application procedure Fees Ecclesiastical buildings and scheduled monuments Ensuring no loss of control	269 269 270 270 270 271
Unifying planning permission and conservation area consent Existing law Proposed reform Responses from consultees Conclusion	273 274 275 275 276
The need for permission Works permitted by development order Heritage partnership agreements Uncertainty as to the need for permission	278 278 279 280
Applications, appeals and other supplementary procedure Applications Appeals Other supplementary provisions	283 283 284 286
Unauthorised works affecting listed buildings and conservation areas The existing law Possible change: prosecution Possible changes: enforcement action	286 286 287 289
Works to scheduled monuments	292
The historic environment: other points Definition of "listed building" Areas of archaeological importance	293 294 295
CHAPTER 14: OUTDOOR ADVERTISING	297
Introduction	297
Basic concepts Definition of "advertisement" Definitions: the site of a display of advertisements Definitions: the person displaying an advertisement	298 298 299 301

Consent for advertisements Deemed consent Powers to make advertisements regulations Overlap with planning permission Advertisements on and in vehicles Need for consent	302 302 304 305 306 308
Breach of advertisements control Deemed consent for advertisements in place for many years Removal of unauthorised advertising Removal of advertisements Prosecution Policy basis for action against unauthorised advertising	310 310 311 312 315 316
Miscellaneous and supplementary provisions Advisory committees and tribunals Experimental areas Compensation for removal of advertisements	317 317 318 318
CHAPTER 15: PROTECTED TREES AND WOODLANDS	321
Introduction Possible reforms	321 322
Tree Preservation Orders What may be protected Policy basis for protection The making of tree preservation orders Notification of new orders	322 322 324 325 329
Works to protected trees Overlap with planning permission Need for consent Works to dead, dying or dangerous trees Works to prevent or abate a nuisance Works to saplings Certificate as to need for consent Applications for consent	330 330 331 331 333 335 337 338
Requirement to plant replacement trees Location of the replacement tree Variation of tree replacement notice Costs incurred by the planning authority	339 339 340 341
Unauthorised works to trees Reckless or indirect damage One offence or two The need to prove an order is available for inspection	341 342 342 343
Trees in conservation areas	345

CHAPTER 16: IMPROVEMENT, REGENERATION AND RENEWAL	347
Introduction Obsolete provisions Our recommendations	347 348 348
Improvement of unsightly land and buildings Section 215 notices Overlap between s 215 of the TCPA 1990 and s 89 of the 1949 Act Landscaping	349 349 355 358
Graffiti and fly-posting	360
Area-based initiatives generally Enterprise zones New town development corporations Urban development corporations Housing action trusts Rural development boards	362 363 365 366 368 369
Acquisition of land for planning purposes	370
Other statutory powers relating to improvement, Regeneration and renewal	372
CHAPTER 17: HIGH COURT CHALLENGES	375
Introduction	375
Challenges as to the validity of decisions	375
Correction of minor errors	377
CHAPTER 18: MISCELLANEOUS AND SUPPLEMENTARY PROVISIONS	379
Introduction	379
Statutory undertakers	379
Minerals	384
Financial provisions	390
Inquiries, hearings and other proceedings	391
Application of provisions in the public health act 1936	395
Interpretation Buildings, plant and machinery Highways Other terms with technical meaning Words in normal use	396 396 397 397 398
Definition of "curtilage"	400
Definition of "agriculture" and related terms	402
Miscellaneous provisions	403

Δ	APPENDIX A: RESPONSES TO CONSULTATION PAPER	407	
	Central Government	407	
	Local authority representative bodies	407	
	Local authorities	407	
	National park authorities	408	
	Community and town councils	408	
	Other public bodies	409	
	Professional bodies	409	
	Lawyers, Planning consultants, architects etc	409	
	Housing bodies	410	
	Rural landowners	410	
	Other landowners, developers etc	410	
	Heritage bodies	410	
	Tree-related organisations	411	
	Faith groups	411	
	Other organisations	412	
	Individuals	412	
APPENDIX B. RECOMMENDATIONS 41			
	Chapter 5. Introductory provisions	415	
	Chapter 6. Formulation of the development plan	418	
	Chapter 7. The Need for a planning application	419	
	Chapter 8. Applications to the planning authority	421	
	Chapter 9. Applications to the Welsh Ministers	427	
	Chapter 10. The provision of infrastructure and other improvements	428	
	Chapter 11. Appeals and other supplementary provisions	430	
	Chapter 12. Unauthorised development	432	
	Chapter 13. Works affecting listed buildings and conservation areas	438	
	Chapter 14. Outdoor advertising	442	
	Chapter 15. Protected trees and woodlands	445	
	Chapter 16. Improvement, regeneration and renewal.	448	
	Chapter 17. High Court challenges	451	
	Chapter 18. Miscellaneous and supplementary provisions	452	

GLOSSARY

Advertisement	A sign, placard, board, notice, hoarding, awning, blind, or other object or structure, that is designed or adapted for the purpose of announcement, publicity or direction, and is used wholly or partly for such a purpose (other than a memorial or railway signal).
Ancient Monuments Act	Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979.
Blight notice	A notice served on a planning authority by the owner of land, requiring the authority to purchase land that has been rendered useless as a result of its allocation in the development plan (or in a similar document).
Breach of condition notice (BCN)	A notice issued by a planning authority requiring the recipient to comply with conditions attached to a planning permission that has been granted for development.
Cadw	The historic environment service of the Welsh Government.
Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL)	A levy imposed on most new development, used to fund local infrastructure (such as parks, sports facilities and police stations), imposed in areas where the planning authority has chosen to charge it.
Certificate of lawfulness of existing use or development (CLEUD)	A certificate issued by the planning authority to the effect that an existing use of land, or development that has been carried out, is immune from enforcement action.
Certificate of lawfulness of proposed use or development (CLOPUD)	A certificate issued by the planning authority to the effect that a proposed use of land, or development that is proposed to be carried out, would not be liable to be the subject of enforcement action.
Compulsory purchase	The acquisition of land, usually by a public authority for a public project, without the consent of the owner, subject to a right of compensation for dispossessed owners and occupiers.
Conservation area	Area of special architectural or historic interest, the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve or enhance, usually designated as such by the planning authority.
Conservation area consent (CAC)	Consent for the demolition of an unlisted building in a conservation area, in addition to planning permission (failure to obtain consent is a criminal offence).
Development	The carrying out of building, engineering, mining or other operations, or the making of a material change in the use of a building or land.

Development plan	Set of documents produced by the Welsh Ministers and planning authorities, setting out their proposals for future development and providing the policy context for making planning decisions.
Development of National Significance (DNS)	A large infrastructure project of national importance (for example, a wind farm, power station or reservoir), requiring approval by the Welsh Ministers rather than the planning authority.
Development order	Secondary legislation granting planning permission for all development in a specific category (general development order) or for some development in a particular area (special or local development order)
Discontinuance Notice	A requirement by the planning authority that an existing lawful activity or operation or use of land should cease (subject to a right to compensation for those suffering loss).
Environmental impact assessment (EIA)	The assessment of the effect of some more significant public and private projects on the environment, originally required under the relevant EU Directive.
Enforcement notice	A notice issued by a planning authority requiring steps to be taken to remedy the effect of unauthorised development, subject to a right of appeal to the Welsh Ministers (non-compliance with the notice is a criminal offence).
Enterprise zone scheme	Scheme made by the Welsh Ministers, under the Local Government Planning and Land Act 1980, effectively granting planning permission for development specified within it.
Felling licence	A licence from Natural Resources Wales authorising the felling of trees, not required for felling on a small scale or in other exceptional cases.
Grampian condition	A condition attached to a planning permission that prohibits it being implemented until some specified event has occurred.
Listed building	Building included by the Welsh Ministers in a list of buildings of special architectural or historic interest, on the advice of Cadw.
Listed building consent (LBC)	Consent required to demolish a listed building or to alter it in any manner that is likely to affect its character as a building of special interest, in some cases in addition to planning permission (failure to obtain consent is a criminal offence).
Listed Buildings Act	Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990
Local infrastructure tariff (LIT)	A proposed replacement for the community infrastructure levy, applying a low tariff to most new developments.
Local planning authority (LPA)	See "Planning authority".

Nationally significant infrastructure project	and specifying the categories of development that constitute development of national significance. Major infrastructure project in one of five categories (electricity generating stations, power lines, underground gas storage,
(NSIP)	pipelines, harbours) requiring development consent from the Secretary of State (not planning permission).
Owner (of land)	Person who would be entitled to receive the rack rent if the land were to be let.
Permitted development	Development, generally minor in character, for which planning permission is granted by a general development order (or, exceptionally, a local development order).
Planning authority	Local authority or national park authority, responsible for producing a development plan and determining applications for planning permission (referred to in legislation as "local planning authority" or "mineral planning authority").
Planning contravention notice (PCN)	A notice issued by a planning authority requiring the recipient to supply information as to the ownership of land, its use, and activities taking place there, and an explanation as to why those use or activities are not in breach of planning control.
Planning enforcement order	An order, granted by a magistrates' court on the application of a planning authority, that allows the authority to extend the time limit within which enforcement action can be taken against a breach of planning control that has been deliberately concealed.
Planning Inspectorate	Executive agency of the Welsh Ministers, responsible for the determination of called-in applications and appeals, and the
(PINS)	holding of inquiries into draft development plans.
(PINS) Planning permission	holding of inquiries into draft development plans. Approval granted by the planning authority or the Welsh Ministers for the carrying out of development.
	Approval granted by the planning authority or the Welsh Ministers

Purchase Notice	A notice served by the owner of land on a planning authority, requiring it to purchase land that has been rendered useless as a result of a planning decision.
Rack rent	Rent representing the full open market annual value of a property, or the market rent.
Scheduled monument	An ancient monument included by the Welsh Ministers in the schedule of monuments under the Ancient Monuments Act.
Scheduled monument consent	Consent needed to demolish or carry almost any works affecting a scheduled monument, obtained from the Welsh Ministers.
Simplified planning zone (SPZ)	Area within which planning permission is granted by a simplified planning zone scheme for development within specified classes.
Statutory undertaker	Public body undertaking the provision of certain public services, including railways, roads, air traffic, canals, docks and harbours, gas, electricity, highways.
Stop notice	A notice issued by a planning authority at the same time as or immediately after the issue of an enforcement notice, requiring unauthorised development to cease immediately.
Technical Advice Note (TAN)	Detailed advice produced by the Welsh Government on a range of topics.
Temporary stop notice (TSN)	A notice served by a planning authority requiring the recipient to cease immediately development appearing to be in breach of planning control.
Tree preservation order (TPO)	An order made by a planning authority to protect specific trees, groups of trees or woodlands in the interests of amenity.
Urban development corporation	An organisation set up by the Welsh Ministers to bring about the development of an urban area.
Whitley principle	The principle that a failure to implement a pre-commencement condition that goes to the heart of the permission renders invalid any purported commencement of the development.

OTHER ABBREVIATIONS

CBC	County Borough Council
CC	County Council
CLA	Country Land and Business Association
DC	District Council
DMP(W)O	Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
GPDO	Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order
HE(W)A	Historic Environment (Wales) Act
MPA	Mineral Products Association
NRW	Natural Resources Wales
PEBA	Planning and Environmental Bar Association
PCPA	Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act
POSW	Planning Officers Society (Wales)
P(W)A	Planning (Wales) Act
RICS	Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors
RTPI	Royal Town Planning Institute
TCP	Town and Country Planning
ТСРА	Town and Country Planning Act

THE LAW COMMISSION

PLANNING LAW IN WALES

To the Right Honourable David Gauke, MP, Lord Chancellor and Secretary of State for Justice