

BRIEFING PAPER NO.7 - JULY 2013

From pillar to post: pan-European racism and the Roma

Europe's Roma face a growing state and popular racism and a double victimisation both as Roma and as migrants

Any hopes of systemic change following the introduction of the 2011 EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies are surely now dashed.¹ Roma - largely unrepresented in parliaments, and whose vote is deemed insignificant by mainstream political parties - are particularly vulnerable at times of severe economic depression², rising nationalism and weak unprincipled governance. It is in this context that European governments, since 2010, have targeted specific migrant communities for removal in an accelerated deportation drive³ (which includes the Romani communities who fled the former-Yugoslavia in the 1990s and have been scattered across Europe for the best part of two decades). For nativism is the guiding principle in establishing residence rights and restricting welfare in a time of austerity. Nativism - the policy of protecting the interests of native-born or established inhabitants against those of immigrants -

means the exclusion of migrants from a whole array of social rights. But hard-heartedness and institutionalised abuse of the foreign poor needs its own rationale, hence nativism's resort to scapegoating. Today, an incendiary racist rhetoric against the migrant poor co-exists with a more generalised class-based, 'strivers versus scroungers' rhetoric. It is Europe's nativist policies, accompanied by the deportation drive, which has ratcheted up the pressure on Roma and Traveller communities - who are being driven from pillar to post. Southern, western and northern Europe now present variations of a pan-European, anti-Roma, anti-Gypsy racism.

Southern Europe: anti-Roma racism implicit in anti-foreigner racism

In southern Europe, nationalism is mobilised around the idea of protecting the nation from the immigrant invasion - and in this sense anti-Roma racism is both

Golden Dawn Sparta march against 'Gypsy predators' in the village of Trapezonti Laconia





Following an outcry, the Italian government had to back down on its plan to fingerprint all Roma living in so-called 'nomad camps'. But the National Census on the Gypsy Population living in the Nomad Camps is ongoing.

woven into anti-foreigner racism (or what we at the IRR call a non-colour coded *xeno-racism*) and runs in tandem with it. Attacks on migrant workers and the undocumented are at the fore, as we saw in April in the Peloponnese where a foreman at a fruit factory opened fire on twenty-eight Bangladeshi migrant strawberry pickers demanding unpaid wages. In countries such as Greece and Italy, where there are scant procedures or structures to deal with racist violence, it is only thanks to the intervention of groups like Doctors Without Borders that many of the undocumented victims of racist violence receive any medical treatment for their injuries at all.⁴

But the Roma – whether citizens or migrants – are also specifically under attack in the generalised anti-foreigner climate. Much has been written about the Greek police's controversial racial profiling dragnet Operation Zeus, under which, between August 2012 and February 2013, almost 85,000 suspected foreigners were forcibly taken to police stations for verification of

their immigration status. (Of these, 94 per cent had a legal right to remain in Greece.)⁵ But less is known about a parallel racial profiling operation targeting the destitute, including those living in long-established Roma settlements which are today being dismantled on the grounds that they are 'gangster enclaves' – hubs for drug dealing and the illegal trade in scrap metal. Since at least December 2012, Roma are amongst the destitute who have been forcibly evicted by the police from settlements in Rhodes, Lamia, across the Peloponnese and the Greater Athens area.⁶ The notion of the criminal Balkan Roma – whether Greek, Bulgarian or Albanian – engaged in the widespread pillaging of public and private property for scrap metal at a time when 'native' Greeks are having to pull together against austerity, plays into the hands of the far Right. The neo-Nazi Golden Dawn, which has eighteen MPs in parliament, is exploiting the economic situation in Greece, where nearly one third of the population lives in extreme poverty and where youth unemployment runs at 59.3 per cent, the highest rate in the EU. Fear is spreading across minority communities, as Golden Dawn mobilises for national preference in all areas of social policy – employment, education, housing, in the distribution of food parcels, even in the donation of blood. According to Golden Dawn political candidate Alexandros Plomaritis, immigrants must be dealt with by reopening 'ovens' and turning them into 'soap'.⁷ In April, members of Golden Dawn, including MP Dimitris Koukoutsis, attempted to target foreign medics by storming the Kalamata hospital in the southern Peloponnese. (In a similar earlier incident at another hospital, four Bulgarian nurses were forced to flee.) This time, the neo-Nazi thugs were not successful, not least because they met opposition from a group of Roma who were at the hospital seeking help for a 22-year-old victim of a racially-motivated attack.⁸ We are likely to see

more such confrontations in Greece, where the Romani people and other minorities cannot rely on the police to curb Golden Dawn, or the criminal justice system to recognise the legal principle of self-defence. The Roma run the risk of criminalisation if they fight back.

Since January 2007, when the 2005 Treaty of Accession came into force, many Roma from Bulgaria and Romania, which have the biggest Roma minorities in Europe, have migrated west- and southwards, sometimes joining the ranks of destitute migrants and failed asylum-seekers in makeshift shanty towns and bidonvilles. As the presence of destitute Roma is taken up in the media, the more prosperous countries of Europe come face to face with the fact (and fall-out) of the structured exclusion of the Roma in eastern and central Europe. The 'Roma issue' serves another purpose: to obscure the economic and policy failures that have caused the emergence of shanty towns as features of life in Europe's inner cities. Thus media and political interest in so-called 'Roma encampments' ignores the fact that many of the shanty towns of Europe are made up of mixed communities, but mainly the foreign poor. But precisely because the shanty town is depicted as emerging from a Roma lifestyle choice and 'the Gypsy propensity to travel', the nativist economic policies and inhumane immigration and asylum laws that give rise to the shanty town are not discussed.⁹

Spain, with its indigenous *Gitanos* population, is often regarded as the model for integration of the Roma in Europe. But the legal movement of Romanian and Bulgarian Roma has led to attempts to win local elections through appealing to fears of a barbarian-style invading Roma underclass. In the first case of its kind involving a serving politician, Xavier García Albiól, the Popular Party mayor of Badalona (a residential area of Greater Barcelona) is being prosecuted for inciting hate, discrimination

and violence. The case, which is backed by SOS Racisme Catalunya, dates back to April 2010 when 15,000 municipal election leaflets were produced, with photos of Gypsies and Romanians along with slogans such as 'insecurity', 'delinquency', 'vandalism'.¹⁰ This is how anti-Roma sentiment is being used to whip up hatred towards a section of bona fide European citizens – if they happen to be migrating from Romania and Bulgaria.

In Italy, in 2008, such anti-Roma scare-mongering was incorporated into national legislation via an emergency government decree. The story of the 'Nomad State of Emergency' started in Rome in October 2007, when there was an anti-foreigner outcry, following the sexual assault and murder of the wife of a navy captain. A 24-year-old Romanian Roma man was arrested, but the entire Romanian community was collectively blamed for the crimes. A first emergency decree was introduced. It was quickly withdrawn on a legal technicality and following a vote of censure in the European parliament, for it had allowed for the summary expulsion (no trial was necessary, only an order from a prefect, the local representatives of the interior ministry) of citizens from other EU states if they were judged a threat to public security.¹¹ Subsequently, in 2008, the government declared a state of emergency in relation to the settlements of so-called 'nomad communities' in five regions of Italy. Both the decree targeted at the Romanians and the Nomad State of Emergency were examples of state racism. Equally contested was the proposal for a 'National Census on the Gypsy population living in the Nomad Camps' which would include the fingerprinting of all Roma. But while the Nomad State of Emergency was subsequently deemed unlawful, the register of the homeless people living in camps (the inhabitants of which may also include migrants from North Africa and other refugees) was implemented in July 2010, and is ongoing

(albeit without the fingerprinting).

Today, the municipalities are responsible for collating data on the homeless and passing it on to the Ministry of the Interior.¹² Presumably the register makes it easier for the immigration police to sweep up the Roma for expulsion. Its deportation drive also has in its sights Romani families, from the former Yugoslavia, who have lived in Italy for more than a decade, who often have children who know no other land. Today, the dismantling of Roma settlements and the deportation of the legally resident Roma – citizens of other European countries – continues on the duplicitous but lawful grounds that they have no means of livelihood and are an 'unreasonable burden on the state'. (It is lawful as EU citizens can be removed from the European country they have migrated to under the 'no recourse to public funds' principle, but duplicitous as destitute Roma in Italy don't tend to claim welfare but survive through begging.)

The 'cleansing of the Roma' has also become one of the central rallying cries of the far Right. In April 2013, at a site in Milan, some 350 Roma, mostly from Romania, were evicted by the authorities who cited security concerns and inability to protect the Roma settlement from increasing hostility after the camp was targeted by Nazi-saluting fascists¹³ in scenes reminiscent, according to the European Roma Rights Centre, of the 2008 pogrom in Ponticelli, Naples,¹⁴ and the 2011 razing of a Roma settlement in La Continassa, Turin.

Eastern/central Europe: violence and flight

If in southern Europe, the far-right position on the Roma is implicit in the attack on poor migrants, in much of eastern Europe, there is nothing implicit about anti-Roma racism – it is explicit to the growth of nationalist and far-right parties like ATAKA

in Bulgaria, which campaigns against the 'Gypsification of Bulgaria' and, since the February 2013 general election, in which it won 7 per cent of the vote, has twenty-four seats in the Bulgarian parliament. An estimated 10 per cent of the Bulgarian population are Roma, giving them the balance of power in certain political constituencies. But civil rights campaigning and voter registration are dangerous options that can incur nationalist wrath. In July 2012, Malin Iliev, a 59-year-old Romani candidate in the municipal elections for the Euroroma party, died a month after sustaining critical injuries when his arm was ripped off in a bomb explosion outside the Euroroma party headquarters in Sandanski.¹⁵ At the time, interior minister Tsvetan Tsvetanov claimed that the murderous attack was not politically motivated but a 'purely criminal act'.¹⁶ Soon afterwards, four men described as 'ultra-nationalists' were arrested.

In much of eastern and central Europe the police can also be implicated in anti-Roma violence. NGOs, including the European Roma Rights Centre, have lodged a case at the Constitutional Court in



In Bulgaria, the headquarters of the Euroroma party was targeted for a bomb attack. Roma candidate Malin Iliev died a month after sustaining critical injuries in the bomb explosion.

Slovakia to bring about a change in legal attitudes following a case involving an off-duty municipal police officer who shot dead three Roma and injured two others in the village of Hurbanovo in 2012. The officer was sentenced to just nine years in prison with psychiatric treatment. A psychologist, when called to give evidence, advised that the sentence be served in an open centre as the need for psychiatric treatment was more important than punishment.¹⁷ The issue of racial motivation for the triple-murder was not even examined in the courtroom, despite the fact that, during examination, the accused frequently spoke of his calling to 'solve the Roma problem' and to 'finally deal with the Roma in Hurbanovo'.¹⁸

But it is in the small villages of Hungary, sometimes controlled by mayors of the far-Right Jobbik party (which has forty-three MPs in the Hungarian parliament), where anti-Roma racism is out of control. It is compounded by the rise of paramilitary forces in the shape of the black-clad militia of the Civic Guard Association for a Better Future (a revival of the Second World War fascist militia, the Arrow Cross) and the neo-Nazi Outlaw Army which patrols Roma neighbourhoods armed with whips and axes, singing war songs, bellowing abuse, shining floodlights into the windows of Roma families at night and carrying out random inspections of yards and living accommodation for cleanliness.¹⁹ Linked to this is an ominous growing nostalgia for Hungary's nationalist past. As the ruling party Fidesz (Alliance of Young Democrats) incorporates some of Jobbik's policies, many who speak up for Roma and against anti-Semitism are accused of treachery and hounded out of public life. And a recent measure, to allow government personnel to inspect people's houses for orderliness as a prerequisite for social assistance payments, is clearly aimed at the Roma.²⁰

Just as in southern Europe, countries in east and central Europe lack the most

basic structures to support the victims of racist violence. And the Fourth Estate is not an ally either. A crucial trial (as serious as that of the National Socialist Underground in Germany) has been ongoing for over two years at the Pest County High Court in Hungary, with barely any coverage in Hungary or abroad.²¹ Some 160 witnesses have been called to give evidence against four neo-Nazis charged with twenty attacks in nine small towns and villages in central and eastern Hungary, during which six Roma, including a 5-year-old child, perished, and with forming a private army to ignite civil war. The Roma survivors of the serial killers face not only the trauma of bereavement, but total impoverishment due to the absence of any official victim support. An 11-year-old child saw his mother murdered. Another family lost their father, the sole breadwinner for the family. Today, most of the families live in abject poverty. Electricity has been cut off as they have no money to pay the bills. A family of six eke out an existence without drinking water. Support from artists, writers and civil society is making it possible for the Roma victims of the neo-Nazi serial killers to heat their homes.²²

Elsewhere in the East, we see the problem of rising fascism compounded by weak political leaders building up electoral support by incorporating nationalist messages on the back of anti-Roma racism. This summer in Slovakia more than 400 mayors signed up to a movement called *Zobudme sa!* (Let's Wake Up!) which aims to coordinate a targeted programme of demolition of Roma settlements – after first redefining them as waste dumps.²³ This repeats the pattern already established in the Czech Republic where, in 2011, mayors from fifty-one communes met in the East Bohemian town of Nový Bydžov to discuss how to deal with 'transients, loiterers' and 'socially unadaptable citizens'.²⁴ In the Czech Republic Roma are frequently referred to as 'inadaptable', despite the fact that this



was the term used by Himmler in 1942 when he gave the order to deport all remaining Roma and Sinti to Auschwitz because they were 'inadaptable people'.²⁵ The message is not lost on the far Right, which created a Facebook page in June entitled 'Protest Actions against Inadaptable Citizens', issuing a call to activists to rally in the south Bohemian city of Ceske Budejovice. This resulted in an estimated 800 neo-Nazis from all over the country travelling to the area and attacking (with Molotov cocktails, stones and broken glass) a counter-rally of Roma and their supporters on a housing estate on the outskirts of the city. It took the riot police - who were severely criticised for their failure to stop the neo-nazis marching on the housing estate - several hours to bring the far-Right rioters under control.²⁶

Western and northern Europe: closing the doors

And what about western and northern Europe, where parliamentarians are prone to associating crude racism with the less-developed, less-democratic former communist East? Here, the coor-

dated centre-right (and now also centre-left) attack on 'the multicultural society' has helped further close the door on Roma flight. It lends credence to the view that the Roma are not an impoverished and forgotten minority, subject to structural violence going back generations. Rather they are viewed as representatives of a barbarian underclass with a backward and criminal culture and lifestyle. Mayoral action against the shantytowns and bidonvilles is not confined to Slovakia and Italy, but takes place

across Europe, in riot-police-led demolition efforts that look increasingly like a coordinated pan-European campaign. Socialist President Hollande came to power in France promising a better deal for the Roma; if shantytowns were to be demolished, the Roma would be rehoused and reintegrated, he declared. But President Hollande and interior minister Manuel Valls have approved the destruction of the shantytowns which are home to the Roma on the grounds that they adversely affect the lives of the French working class living near to them.²⁷ Following six raids in the summer of 2012, an estimated 1,000 Roma were deported to Bulgaria and Romania, although the exact figure is hard to establish as statistics do not record ethnicity. To



do so would suggest discrimination, which is unlawful!²⁸ After a recent bout of deportations of Roma, Christophe Crépin of the main police union, UNSA Police, declared 'We salute the firmness of Mr Valls in his Roma policy ... These are people who sell themselves, who racketeer, who construct criminal networks, and their way of life is totally incompatible with that of our modern societies.'²⁹

Without doubt, at the EU level there is acute awareness of the ratcheting up of hate against the Roma in countries like Bulgaria, Romania and Hungary. But the EU countries are not prepared to adequately fund the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies or to prioritise social justice and an end to structural violence against Europe's most marginalised minority. Terrified of further Roma migration westwards, as well as the possibility of renewed conflict in the western Balkans, countries are barricading the bridges.

We can see how the French interior minister Valls is influenced by the rising moral panic. During an interview with *Le Figaro*, he said that around 20,000 Roma migrants from Bulgaria and Romania, living in some 400 camps, had no interest in integrating into French society 'for cultural reasons or because they are in the hands of begging or prostitution networks'.³⁰ We see it in Germany in the current hysteria around migrants from Romania and Bulgaria, in the increasing return by Germany, Sweden, Switzerland and Denmark of Roma, Ashkali and Balkan Egyptians to Kosovo, and Roma to Serbia, despite the fact that they have no homes to go to, and many of their children have spent nearly their whole childhood in western and northern Europe and do not know the language of the country they are being returned to. We see it in Norway, where the Progress Party and the Conservatives – responding to local government demands to deal with the Roma

migration – have announced that they will make a ban on begging, a central issue in the September general election.³¹ And we see it in the way David Cameron whipped up hostility against Romanian and Bulgarian so-called 'benefit tourists', and in the letter from the British, Austrian, German and Dutch interior ministers sent in April 2013 to the Irish president of the EU's Justice and Home Affairs Council, demanding further restrictions on poor EU migrants who travel across visa-free borders to 'abuse' social welfare systems. The coding is clear: for 'poor Romanians and Bulgarians' read 'Roma'.³²

De facto statelessness

In her consideration of the plight of refugees during and after the Second World War, Hannah Arendt wrote that 'the moment human beings lacked their own government and had to fall back upon their minimum rights, no authority was left to protect them and no institution was willing to guarantee them'.³³ What the current onslaught against the Roma throws up today is the issue of *de facto* statelessness.³⁴ In the absence of state protection, civil society must move to protect the vulnerable, particularly the Roma children. Many are in families displaced during the break-up of the former Yugoslavia and have lived in other European countries for decades, often rightless and paperless. In Greece, a law known as the Ragoussis law, passed three years ago, took the first timid steps in reforming citizenship laws, allowing second-generation migrants the right to apply for Greek citizenship. Recently it was struck down, ruled unconstitutional by the Council of State in a decision that has left an estimated 200,000 children in limbo. Nineteen migrant rights groups, supported by the journalists' union ESHEA, have issued a joint statement accusing the government of 'adopting a right-wing agenda' stating the only group applauding the Council of State's decision is Golden

Dawn.³⁵ But deputy interior minister Haralambos Athanassiou remains unrepentant, stating that the Ragoussis law will be replaced with legislation requiring migrants to show a 'genuine bond' with Greece and prove assimilation into Greek culture.³⁶

Meanwhile, in Italy an ugly and incendiary hate campaign, including death threats, has been launched against the country's first Black cabinet minister. Cécile Kyenge, a naturalised Italian citizen originally from the Democratic Republic of the Congo, is Italy's first Black minister for integration. This has been no cause for celebration for the rightwing Northern League, with one politician accusing her of seeking to 'impose her tribal traditions' on Italy,³⁷ while another wrote on Facebook, 'Won't someone rape her, just to make her understand what victims of this terrible crime feel'.³⁸ While anti-black racism is central to this ugly campaign, the racist hysteria against the presence of a Black woman in parliament is also related to the integration minister's tentative proposals to reform Italian citizenship laws, so as to open up a route to citizenship for the children of migrants, such as the Romani communities from the former-Yugoslavia who in future would be allowed to apply for Italian nationality when they reach the age of 18.³⁹

Europe's Roma are caught – between the policies of eastern, southern and northern Europe and between the state, the far Right and a new pan-European racism. As they are shunted from one country to the next, Europe takes on all the characteristics of a huge open prison. Their only recourse now is to us, to civil society. ■

An extended version of a speech made by IRR Director Liz Fekete on 24 June 2013 at the Evangelische Akademie in Berlin.

Thanks to Sara Cerretelli (Cooperazione per lo Sviluppo dei Paesi Emergenti), Panayote Dimitras (Greek Helsinki Monitor), Xenia Passa (PASSA, Protection Associate, UNHCR-Athens) Ian Hancock and Thomas Acton for their patience in answering my questions.

References

- 1** For a critique of what has been achieved to date, see David Mark, 'European Roma at Crossroads: politics and empowerment', in *Recycling Hatred: Racism(s) in Europe Today*, ENAR Anti-Racism in Focus 1 (February 2013). For an update on the European Commission's progress report on Roma integration see Belén Sánchez-Rubio, 'Wake-up call to EU countries on Roma integration', Public Service Europe (4 July 2013), available at [http://www.icare.to/news.php?en#Wake-up call to EU countries on Roma integration](http://www.icare.to/news.php?en#Wake-up%20call%20to%20EU%20countries%20on%20Roma%20integration).
- 2** In May, the secretary-general of the International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies warned of the growing humanitarian crisis as Europe experiences its biggest depression since the Second World War. The number of people receiving food aid from the IFRC has nearly doubled from 2.3 million in 2009 to 4.1 million today. Twelve per cent of Europe's workforce is unemployed, while EU figures suggest that 120 million - nearly a quarter of the EU population - are at risk of poverty and social exclusion. 'Unrest may spread across Europe, warns Red Cross Chief', 24 May 2013. Available at: <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/unrest-may-spread-across-europe-warns-red-cross-chief-8631698.html>
- 3** See 'Accelerated removals: a study of the human cost of EU deportation policies, 2009-2010', IRR ERA Briefing Paper No. 4, October 2010. Available at http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper4.pdf
- 4** See 'REPORT by Nils Muilnieks, Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights Following his visit to Greece, from 28 January to 1 February 2013', Council of Europe, CommDH (2013), 6, 16 April 2013. Available at [https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?Ref=CommDH\(2013\)6&Language=lanEnglish&Ver=original&BackColorInternet=B9BDEE&BackColorIntranet=FFCD4F&BackColorLogged=FFC679](https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?Ref=CommDH(2013)6&Language=lanEnglish&Ver=original&BackColorInternet=B9BDEE&BackColorIntranet=FFCD4F&BackColorLogged=FFC679).
- 5** See 'Unwelcome Guests: Greek police abuses of migrants in Athens', Human Rights Watch, available at <http://www.hrw.org/news/2013/06/12/greece-abusive-crackdown-migrants>.
- 6** Greek Helsinki Monitor, 'Greece: Mainstream racism and discrimination', Press Release, 9 December 2012. Available at ghm1424_racism_discrimination_english.doc; 'Greek police say Roma camps gangster enclaves', *Greek Reporter* (30 December 2012). Available at <http://greece.greekreporter.com/2012/12/30/greek-police-say-roma-camps-gangster-enclaves/>.
- 7** 'Golden Dawn film: Greek police probe neo-Nazi hate speech', Channel 4 News (6 March 2013). Available at <http://www.channel4.com/news/golden-dawn-film-greek-police-probe-neo-nazi-hate-speech>.
- 8** 'Neo-Nazi Golden Dawn Thugs Clash with Roma in Kalamata Hospital Raid', *International Business Times* (10 April 2013). Available at <http://www.icare.to/articleHC.php?id=45280&lang=en>.
- 9** I am very grateful to Thomas Acton for pointing these distinctions out to me.
- 10** 'Badalona mayor faces trial on race-hate rap', *El País* (12 April 2013). Available at http://elpais.com/elpais/2013/04/12/inenglish/1365795341_087401.html.
- 11** The prologue to the emergency decree made it clear it was aimed at Romanians. See 'Italy: emergency laws, summary expulsions and a climate of hate', *European Race Bulletin*, No. 63 (Spring 2008). Available at <http://www.irr.org.uk/news/europe-mobilising-against-foreign-criminals>.
- 12** Decreto del Ministero dell'Interno 6 Luglio 2010, available at http://www.interno.gov.it/min-interno/site/it/sezioni/servizi/legislazione/sicurezza/0966_2010_07_06_DM06072010.html.
- 13** 'Far-right groups target Roma with violent protests in Italy', European Roma Rights centre, 19 April 2013. Available at <http://www.errc.org/article/far-right-groups-target-roma-with-violent-protests-in-italy/4132>.
- 14** On the nights of 13 and 14 May 2008, following rumours that a Roma teenager had attempted to kidnap a baby, mobs went on the rampage, and the Ponticelli camp on the outskirts of eastern Naples was subjected to repeated petrol bomb attacks. As the first Molotov cocktails descended on the encampment, Roma fled to another encampment, which was also attacked, leading to evacuation. See 'The Italian General Election and its aftermath', IRR European Race Bulletin No. 64 (Summer 2008).
- 15** Bernard Rorke, 'Roma inclusion in 2012: no respite in prejudice', *Open Democracy* (11

January 2013). Available at <<http://www.open-democracy.net/bernard-rorke/roma-inclusion-in-2012-no-respite-in-prejudice-0>>.

16 'Sandanski Blast Not Political - Bulgarian Top Cop', NoInVite.com (29 June 2012). Available at <www.novinite.com/view_news.php?id=140799?>

17 For the Romani Union Party critique of the 'absurdly low sentence ... disproportionate to the seriousness of the crime' see 'Slovakia: punishment for shooter of three Romani victims called absurdly low', ROMEA.cz (28 March 2013). Available at <<http://www.romea.cz/en/news/slovakia-punishment-for-shooter-of-three-romani-victims-called-absurdly-low>>.

18 'One Year on From Roma Deaths, ERRC Highlights Low Sentence for Mass Murderer in Slovakia', European Roma Rights Centre, Press Statement (17 June 2013). Available at <<http://www.errc.org/article/one-year-on-from-roma-deaths-errc-highlights-low-sentence-for-mass-murderer-in-slovakia/4150>>.

19 See Liz Fekete, *Pedlars of Hate: the violent impact of the European far Right*, Institute of Race Relations (2012).

20 Keno Verseck, 'Blurring Boundaries: Hungarian leaders adopt policies of far Right', *Der Spiegel* (30 January 2013). Available at <<http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/ruling-hungarian-fidesz-party-adopts-policies-of-far-right-jobbik-party-a-880590.html>>.

21 See Liz Fekete 'Security intelligence agencies and the far Right: a review of developments in Germany, Hungary and Austria', IRR ERP Briefing Paper No. 6 (April 2013).

22 Interview and email exchange (February 2013) with József Gulyás, chair of the 'Committee to review the failure of the secret services in the case of the Roma assassinations'.

23 See Bernard Rorke, Open Democracy, op.cit.

24 See Liz Fekete, *Pedlars of Hate*, op.cit.

25 Gwendolyn Albert, who works with ROMEA, says that since about 2006 it has become standard for the media to use the term 'inadaptable' as a way of referring to the Roma and the Czech News Agency now puts out press releases without even bothering to put question marks around the term. See also 'Czech Govt Human Rights Commissioner: The term "inadaptable" deprives Roma of their humanity', ROMEA.cz (19 May 2013).

26 'Czech mayor blames police tactics in clash with neo-Nazi protestors', UPI.com (2 July 2013), available at <http://www.upi.com/Top_News/Special/2013/07/02/Czech-mayor-blames-police-tactics-in-clash-with-neo-Nazi-protestors/UPI-92041372737840/>.

27 'French police clear Gypsy camps in new crackdown on illegal immigrants', *Daily Mail* (5 June 2013), available at <<http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2336311/French-police-clear-gypsy-camp-new-crackdown-illegal-immigrants.html>>.

28 *Daily Mail*, ibid.

29 Stephen Erlanger, 'Treatment still harsh for Roma in France', *New York Times* (3 June 2013). Available at <http://www.nytimes.com/2013/06/04/world/europe/roma-still-shunned-in-france-ahead-of-eu-rules-change.html?pagewanted=all&_r=0>.

30 For the reaction of Voix des Roms, who described Valls' comments as 'concentrated lies ... designed to smear the entire community', see 'French minister accused of racism following Roma comment', *EuroActiv* (18 March 2013). Available at <<http://www.euractiv.com/justice/french-minister-accused-racism-f-news-518579>>.

31 'Parliament refused to ban begging', *News in English*, no 11 (June 2013). Available at <<http://www.newsinenglish.no/2013/06/11/parliament-refused-to-ban-begging>>.

32 The Conservative interior minister Hans-Peter Friedrich told other EU state interior ministers at a meeting in Luxembourg that he wanted 'to throw out without much of a to-do; those illegal immigrants who appear to be in Germany just for the social system and come specifically from Romania and Bulgaria'. This was represented in the media under the headline 'Germany to Deport Poverty Immigrants'. See *Spiegel Online* (6 June 2013). Available at <<http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/german-interior-minister-expell-eastern-european-poverty-immigrants-a-904415.html>>.

33 Hannah Arendt, *The Origins of Totalitarianism* (New York, Schocken Books), p. 370.

34 In 2011, the UNHCR conducted a project mapping statelessness in Greece, Albania and Italy which drew attention to the specific problems associated with the Roma population of Greek origin. Roma children born outside hospital are

often not registered on the municipal role (or, if registered, incorrectly). The Roma community of Albanian origin often live in conditions of illegality. Many children are either registered under a false name, or not at all. Email correspondence with Xenia Passa, PASSA (Protection Associate) UNHCR Athens, 10 July 2013.

35 'Migrant groups slam government over Greek citizenship law', *ekathimerini.com* (2 July 2013). Available at <http://www.ekathimerini.com/4dcgi/_w_articles_wsitel_1_27/02/2013_484682>.

36 Ibid.

37 Northern League MEP Mario Borghezio described Italy's current government as a 'bonga bonga government' at the same time as making these comments about Kyenge. He was subsequently expelled from the Europe of Freedom and Democracy Group of the European Parliament.

38 Dolores Valendro, a councillor from Padua, was subsequently expelled from the party. Sarah Gates, 'Dolores Valendro expelled from Italian party after calling for rape of Italy's first Black cabinet minister', *Huffington Post* (13 June 2013). Available at <http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/06/13/dolores-valandro-rape-cecile-kyenge-facebook_n_3435633.html>.

39 See Daniela Di Rada, 'Roma statelessness in Italy - field research reveals long-awaited data', European Network on Statelessness (3 April 2013). Available at <<http://www.statelessness.eu/blog/roma-statelessness-italy-%E2%80%93-field-research-reveals-long-awaited-data>>.

THE IRR'S EUROPEAN RESEARCH PROGRAMME (ERP)

The IRR's European Race Programme (ERP) is now publishing regular free online briefing papers which are available as part of subscriptions to the IRR News Service. The ERP is one of the few sources of comprehensive pan-European information on racism, the extreme Right and Islamophobia. It also documents the erosion of human rights as a result of asylum and immigration law and civil liberties and as a result of the war on terror. The European Race Programme was launched in 1991 and its huge archive - of over sixty Bulletins on pan-European race and refugee issues - is an invaluable source of information for students, researchers and campaigners.

SEE BELOW FOR RECENT BRIEFING PAPERS

Briefing Paper No. 6 - April 2013

State intelligence agencies and the far Right: A review of developments in Germany, Hungary and Austria.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/ERP_BP6_State_intelligence.pdf (pdf file, 544kb)

Briefing Paper No. 5 - September 2011

Breivik, the conspiracy theory and the Oslo massacre.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper5.pdf (pdf file, 444kb)

Briefing Paper No. 4 - October 2010

Accelerated removals: a study of the human cost of EU deportation policies, 2009-2010.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper4.pdf (pdf file, 1.3mkb)

Briefing Paper No. 3 - April 2010

The background to the French parliamentary commission on the burqa and niqab.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper3.pdf (pdf file, 145kb)

Briefing Paper No. 2 - February 2010

Direct democracy, racism and the extreme Right.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper2.pdf (pdf file, 200kb)

Briefing Paper No. 1 - February 2010

The Swiss referendum on minarets: background and aftermath.

Download at:

http://www.irr.org.uk/pdf2/ERA_BriefingPaper1.pdf (pdf file, 152kb)

Also see the link below for free access to our archive:

<http://www.irr.org.uk/publications/briefing-europe/>

This briefing is part of the European Research Programme supported by the Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust and Open Society Foundations. Please acknowledge IRR's European Research Programme in any use of this work. For further information contact Liz Fekete, email: liz@irr.org.uk.

Research on the European Race Programme is carried out with the help of:

Harmit Athwal, Jenny Bourne, Norberto Laguía Casaus, Rhona Desmond, Imogen Foster, Joschka Fröschner, Chandra Frank, Zoé Gardner, Kate Harre, Simon Katzenellenbogen, Sibille Merz, Graham Murray, Lotta Schwedler, Joanna Tegnerowicz and Frances Webber.

Institute of Race Relations

2-6 Leeke Street, London WC1X 9HS

Tel: 020 7837 0041 / Fax: 020 7278 0623

Email: info@irr.org.uk / Web: www.irr.org.uk / Twitter: @IRR_News