

LGBCE (18)3rd Meeting

Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday 20th March 2018 at 12:45pm, in Belgravia Suite, 29th Floor, Millbank Tower, Millbank, London, SW1P 4QP

Commissioners Present

Professor Colin Mellors OBE (Chair)
Alison Lowton
Susan Johnson OBE
Peter Maddison QPM
Andrew Scallan CBE
Steve Robinson

LGBCE Officers Present:

Jolyon Jackson CBE	Chief Executive
Lynn Ingram	Director of Finance & Resources
Marcus Howell	Director of Strategy & Communications
Alison Evison	Review & Programme Manager
Jo Porter	Review Manager
Dan Carlsson-Hyslop	Review Officer (items 2 & 6)
Mishka Mayers	Review Officer (item 3)
Paul Kingsley	Review Officer (item 4)
Laura Taylor	Review Officer (item 5)
David Owen	Review Officer (item 7)
Emily Starkie	Review Officer (item 8)
Jonathan Ashby	Review Officer (item 9)
Alex Tudge	Data and Information Officer (item 15)
Angela Hendry	Office Manager/HR Lead (minutes)

Apologies for Absence

Apologies had been received from Richard Buck.

Declarations of interest

The Chair declared an interest in item 9 (Scarborough Final Recommendations), and took no part in the discussion of that item.

Minutes of LGBCE's meeting on 20th February 2018

The minutes were agreed subject to the following amendment.

Item 12, Audit & Risk Committee – Chair's Report. ARC considered that further consideration by the Commission that community identity would be helpful together with use of associated equalities data.

Matters Arising

It was noted that draft ARC minutes should come to the following Commission meeting.

Actions from the previous Commission meeting

- Review of Board effectiveness be added to the Actions table

1. Operational Report - LGBCE (18)24

The Chief Executive presented the Operational Report for March and the Commission noted its content.

A discussion took place on the recurring issue of how to address inadequate council size submissions and dealing with councils that failed to put forward warding patterns at the initial stage. It was noted that, where we anticipate receiving an inadequate submission about either council size or warding pattern, this is pursued by a letter from the Chief Executive. It was agreed to discuss this matter further at the away day to consider if there are other ways of encouraging high-quality submissions.

London Borough reviews - The Commission noted, where briefings have taken place with London Boroughs, a further briefing has been offered post election.

2. Warwick Draft Recommendations - LGBCE (18)25

The review of Warwick District Council had commenced on 21 November 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 27 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with the highest variance being 19 per cent.

At its meeting on 21 November 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 44 and the Draft Recommendations being considered had been prepared on the basis of such a council size.

In preparing the draft scheme, the team had taken into consideration both the submissions it had received and the statutory criteria. The Draft Recommendations proposed a pattern of 11 three-, 5 two-, and 1 single member wards in total.

The Commission considered the recommendations in detail informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the advice of officers and the submissions received.

It agreed the Draft Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Draft Recommendations for Warwick as presented.

3. Copeland Draft Recommendations – LGBCE(18)26

The review of Copeland Council had commenced on 21 November 2018. According to the latest available electoral figures, 20 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with 12 per cent of wards being over 20 per cent. One ward, St Bees, had a variance of 27 per cent. The review had been requested by the Council.

At its meeting on 21 November 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 33 and the Draft Recommendations being considered had been prepared on the basis of such a council size.

In preparing the draft scheme, the team had taken into consideration both the submissions it had received and the statutory criteria. The Draft Recommendations proposed a pattern of 6 three-, 3 two-, and 9 single member wards in total.

The Commission considered the recommendations in detail informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the advice of officers and the submissions received.

The Commission moved away from the team's recommendations in Copeland as it considered that the parish of Weddicar should be divided between wards, as outlined in the identical local schemes presented. In doing so, it noted that this would result in the creation of a parish ward with fewer electors than normally approved. However, the Commission considered that the strength of local proposals put forward by four respondents (including the Council) provided a better reflection of the statutory criteria in this area of Copeland.

It agreed the Draft Recommendations as presented with amendments in the following areas:

- Moor Row & Bigrigg area
- Frizington & Moresby area
- Arlecdon & Ennerdale area

Agreed

Draft Recommendations for Copeland as modified.

4. King's Lynn & West Norfolk – LGBCE (18)27 Final Recommendations

The review of King's Lynn & West Norfolk had commenced on 20 June 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, one ward, Brancaster, had a variance of over 30 per cent.

At its meeting on 20 June 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 54 and had subsequently, on 17 October 2017, agreed Draft Recommendations.

Following publication, 26 submissions had been received which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

Taking all of the submissions into account, for the reasons highlighted in the team's report, it was felt that there was sufficient evidence to move away from the Draft Recommendations in some aspects and these changes were reflected in the Final Recommendations put to the Commission for consideration.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 2 three-, 16 two-, and 17 single member wards.

The Commission considered the Final Recommendations in detail, informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the submissions received following publication of the Draft Recommendations.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for King's Lynn & West Norfolk as presented.

5. Rutland Final Recommendations – LGBCE (18)28

The review of Rutland had commenced on 18 July 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 13 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with 7 per cent of wards being over 20 per cent. One ward, Oakham North West had a variance greater than 50 per cent.

At its meeting on 18 July 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 26.

At its meeting on 21 November 2018, the Commission considered the recommendations of the team and agreed to move away from its original opinion on council size and, instead, agreed a council size of 27 as this provided for a better pattern across the local authority.

Following publication, 36 submissions had been received commenting on the Draft Recommendations which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

Taking all of the submissions into account, for the reasons highlighted in the team's report, it was felt that there was sufficient evidence to move away from the Draft Recommendations in some aspects and these changes were reflected in the Final Recommendations put to the Commission for consideration.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 2 three-, 8 two-, and 5 single member wards in total.

The Commission considered the Final Recommendations in detail, informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the submissions received following publication of the Draft Recommendations.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for Rutland as presented.

6. Nottingham Final Recommendations – LGBCE (18)29

The review of Nottingham had commenced on 16 May 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 20 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with one ward, Wollaton East & Lenton Abbey being greater than 30 per cent.

At its meeting on 16 May 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 55 and had subsequently, on 17 October 2017, agreed Draft Recommendations.

Following publication, 329 submissions had been received commenting on the Draft Recommendations which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

Taking all of the submissions into account, for the reasons highlighted in the team's report, it was felt that there was sufficient evidence to move away from the Draft Recommendations in some aspects and these changes were reflected in the Final Recommendations put to the Commission for consideration.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 15 three-, and five two-member wards in total.

The Commission considered the Final Recommendations in detail, informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the submissions received following publication of the Draft Recommendations.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented with amendments to the Clifton area.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for Nottingham as modified.

7. Richmondshire Final Recommendations – LGBCE (18)30

The review of Richmondshire had commenced on 16 May 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 25 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10

per cent. One ward, Hornby Castle, had a variance of 29 per cent. The review had been requested by the Council.

At its meeting on 16 May 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 24 and had subsequently, on 17 October 2017, agreed Draft Recommendations.

Following publication, 100 submissions had been received commenting on the Draft Recommendations which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

Taking all of the submissions into account, for the reasons highlighted in the team's report, it was felt that there was sufficient evidence to move away from the Draft Recommendations in some aspects and these changes were reflected in the Final Recommendations put to the Commission for consideration.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 1 three-, 6 two-, and 9 single member wards in total.

The Commission considered the Final Recommendations in detail, informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the submissions received following publication of the Draft Recommendations.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for Richmondshire as presented.

8. East Hampshire Final Recommendations – LGBCE (18)31

The review of East Hampshire had commenced on 16 May 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 39 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with 3 wards being greater than 20 per cent.

At its meeting on 16 May 2017, the Commission had been minded to agree a council size of 44. However at its meeting on 19 September 2017, the Commission agreed to an amendment to the Draft Recommendations from 44 to 43 members as this would better reflect the statutory criteria.

Following publication, 130 submissions had been received commenting on the Draft Recommendations which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 2 three-, 8 two-, and 21 single member wards.

Taking all of the submissions into account, it had been decided that there was sufficient evidence to undertake a period of further limited consultation focusing on

the proposals for the Alton, Homdean and Rowlands Castle areas before the Commission agreed its Final Recommendations.

Fifty seven submissions were received in relation to the Further Consultation on proposals for Alton, Homdean and Rowlands Castle areas.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for East Hampshire as presented.

9. Scarborough Final Recommendations – LGBCE (18)32

The Chair) left the meeting and took no part in the discussion of this item. The item was chaired by Peter Maddison

The review of Scarborough had commenced on 16 May 2017. According to the latest available electoral figures, 32 per cent of wards had variances greater than 10 per cent with 4 per cent of ward being over 20 per cent.

At its meeting on 17 Oct 2017, as a result of further consideration and, on the basis of the evidence, the Commission agreed to move away from its original opinion on council size and, instead, agreed a council size of 46. This provided for better electoral equality and a more coherent warding pattern particularly in Scarborough town.

Following publication, 28 submissions had been received commenting on the Draft Recommendations which had been considered carefully in the context of the statutory criteria.

Taking all of the submissions into account, for the reasons highlighted in the team's report, it was felt that there was sufficient evidence to move away from the Draft Recommendations in some aspects and these changes were reflected in the Final Recommendations put to the Commission for consideration.

The Final Recommendations proposed a pattern of 8 three-, 10 two-, and 2 single member wards in total.

The Commission considered the Final Recommendations in detail, informed by the statutory criteria and taking into account the submissions received following publication of the Draft Recommendations.

It agreed the Final Recommendations as presented.

Agreed

Final Recommendations for Scarborough as presented.

10. Five Year Programme – LGBCE (18)33

The Commission noted the five-year programme setting out the list of authorities that meet the intervention criteria on the basis of the December 2017 data. It also updated and consolidated the five-year programme and set out the team's approach to populating the five-year programme with specific reviews. Officers would write to authorities that potentially meet FER criteria and report back to a future meeting in order to agree next year's programme.

11. Chair's Report

The Chair updated on the latest position on the appointment of new Commissioners.

The Commission agreed to hold the strategic away days 30 - 31 July.

12. Chief Executive's Report

The Chief Executive updated on the last relocation Steering Group meeting and the progress towards moving to Windsor House at the end of June.

13. Director of Finance and Resources Report – LGBCE (18)34

The Commission noted the budget for 2018/19. It was noted that the main impact on the budget for next year will be the move to Windsor House; however, we will be saving on conference facilities.

There was a discussion on the background of the decision to move to Windsor House and how this affects the budget. The Director of Finance & Resources to circulate the Business case to Commissioners.

The Commission noted the NAO Short Guide report.

14. ARC Terms of Reference – LGBCE (18)36

The Commission agreed the new Terms of Reference for ARC with the amendment as agreed to combine the two sections on responsibilities.

It was noted in this, and other documents, that it would be helpful to find a way of distinguishing when 'Commission' described the totality of the LGBCE and when it specifically referred to the Commissioners acting as the 'Board' of LGBCE. The Chief Executive agreed to look through the appropriate documents and ensure that there was clarity.

15. KPIs – LGBCE (18)37

The Commission noted the new KPIs and that the measures which will be reported on a quarterly basis. It was noted that this is currently an internal document to consider whether the proposed benchmarks were appropriate. .

Alison Evison talked through each of the KPIs and data being measured. The Commission agreed to take this approach forward.

16. Future Business – LGBCE (18)38

The special Commission meeting in October would be re-scheduled for 5 October 2018 and added to Future Business.

AOB

There were no other items.

Close of Business 16:50

 21/5/18

